



Tomorrow's Doctors, Tomorrow's Cures®



Marisha Burden, MD
Amira del Pino-Jones, MD
Scott Saunders, MD
Reem Hanna, MD
Michelle Shafer, MD
Sangini Sheth, MD
Kathryn Rexrode, MD

GWIMS Toolkit

GWIMS Equity Recruitment Toolkit

Your Go To Equity Guide for Recruitment:

Recruitment for positions,
committees (search and non-
search), and speakership

Updated May 2023



**Diversity drives
innovation - when we
limit who can contribute,
we in turn limit what
problems we can solve.**

Telle Whitney

GWIMS Toolkit



AAMC
Tomorrow's Doctors, Tomorrow's Cures®

Background



Background – Importance of Diversity

- Diversification improves performance by providing variety in perspectives and skills and allows for more effective problem-solving.
- Increased diversity is associated with higher profits and a range of financial awards (innovation, increased productivity, improved accuracy in risk assessment, and improved patient health outcomes).
- Increased diversity in the healthcare workforce helps reduce or eliminate racial health disparities.
- Research teams composed of people from diverse backgrounds and experiences produce better and more innovative products and ideas.
- Diversity is associated with better financial performance and a higher quality of patient care.

References

1. L Gomea, P Bernet. Diversity improves performance and outcomes. J Nat Med Assoc. 2019;11(4):383-392.
2. L Hong, SE Page. Groups of diverse problem solvers can outperform groups of high-ability problem solvers. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2004 Nov 16;101(46):16385-9.
3. <https://extramural-diversity.nih.gov/diversity-matters>

Background – Gender Disparity

- Disparities in the representation of women within academic medicine persist.
- While 48% of medical school graduates are women, they only account for 25% of full professors, 14% of department chairs, and 18% of deans at medical schools.
- Women have less academic productivity in terms of publications and their impact, with one study showing that women comprised 32% of first authors and less than 20% senior authors on review of 1,000 peer-reviewed research articles from 2000-2017.
- Gender bias is cited as one of the main drivers of gender disparity.
- Men are overrepresented in research careers at the NIH.

References

1. Carr PL , Gunn CM , Kaplan SA , et al. Inadequate progress for women in academic medicine: findings from the National Faculty Study. *J Women's Health* 2015;24:190.
2. Association of American Medical Colleges: The State of Women in Academic Medicine. [Accessed January 25, 2022.] Available at: <https://www.aamc.org/data-reports/data/2018-2019-state-women-academic-medicine-exploring-pathways-equity>
3. Raj A, Carr PL, Kaplan SE, Terrin N, Breeze JL, Freund KM. Longitudinal Analysis of Gender Differences in Academic Productivity Among Medical Faculty Across 24 Medical Schools in the United States. *Acad Med*. 2016;91(8):1074-1079. doi:10.1097/ACM.0000000000001251
4. Carnes M, Geller S, Fine E, Sheridan J, Handelsman J. NIH Director's Pioneer Awards: Could the selection process be biased against women. *J Women's Health* 2005;14:684-691.

References, cont.

5. Burgess DJ, Joseph A, van Ryn M, Carnes M. Does stereotype threat affect women in academic medicine? *Acad Med* 2012; 87:506-512
6. Bernardi K, Lyons NB, Huang L, et al. Gender Disparity in Authorship of Peer-Reviewed Medical Publications. *Am J Med Sci*. 2020;360(5):511-516
7. Safdar B, Naveed S, Chaudhary AMD, Saboor S, Zeshan M, Khosa F. Gender Disparity in Grants and Awards at the National Institute of Health. *Cureus*. 2021 Apr 23;13(4):e14644.

Timeout!

We recognize that gender does not exist as a binary construct. Unfortunately, much of the data with regard to hiring practices have reported gender in this way. Our recommendations are evidence-based and reflect this data, but we recommend seeking gender diversity beyond men and women whenever possible. Guidelines for the ratios of men and women in groups are rough guidelines and do not negate the need to represent other gender expressions. We advise that institutions be thoughtful when seeking this diversity, as to not contribute to individuals feeling tokenized. An example of tokenization might be a non-binary person being asked to serve more than their fair share on search committees due to the diversity they bring.

Background – LGBTQ+ Workplace Disparity

- In 2022, only 23 states have statutes that protect against sexual orientation discrimination in employment in the public and private sector. Fewer protect against gender identity discrimination.
- Studies using resumes indicating they belong to gay men, queer women, or transgender applicants receive fewer callbacks nationwide (varies by region).
- Gay men earn 10% - 32% less than heterosexual men in the United States.
- Workers that transition from male to female experience a nearly one third decrease in earnings on average.

References

1. Tilcsik, András. "Pride and Prejudice: Employment Discrimination against Openly Gay Men in the United States." *American Journal of Sociology*, vol. 117, no. 2, The University of Chicago Press, 2011, pp. 586-626, <https://doi.org/10.1086/661653>.
2. Mishel, Emma. "Discrimination against Queer Women in the U.S. Workforce: A Résumé Audit Study." *Socius: Sociological Research for a Dynamic World*, vol. 2, 2016, pp. 1-13.
3. Rainey, Teresa, and Elliot Imse. *Qualified and Transgender*, 3 Nov. 2015, <https://ohr.dc.gov/page/QualifiedAndTransgender>.
4. Badgett, Lee & Lau, Holning & Sears, Brad & Ho, Deborah. (2007). Bias in the Workplace: Consistent Evidence of Sexual Orientation and Gender Identity Discrimination. *Chicago-Kent Law Review*. 84
5. Schilt, Kristen and Wiswall, Matthew. "Before and After: Gender Transitions, Human Capital, and Workplace Experiences" *The B.E. Journal of Economic Analysis & Policy*, vol. 8, no. 1, 2008. <https://doi.org/10.2202/1935-1682.1862>

Background – Racial and Ethnic Disparities

- Even though their representation in academic medicine has increased over time, African Americans/Blacks, Latinx/Hispanic, Native Americans, Alaskan Natives, Native Hawaiians, and Pacific Islanders remain underrepresented in medicine, relative to their numbers in the general population, and are lagging in rates of promotion at the assistant and associate professor ranks.
- Minority tax (extra, financially uncompensated duties and responsibilities that minorities are asked to perform often as part of diversity recruitment efforts) is a major source of inequity in academic medicine.
- According to one study, Underrepresented Minority (URM) faculty had fewer publications and were less likely to be retained in academic medicine.
- Black faculty have cited lack of mentorship and sponsorship, barriers to promotion and advancement, and lack of supportive work environments as factors leading to attrition from academic medical centers.

References

1. D Fang, E Moy, L Colburn, J Hurley. Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Faculty Promotion in Academic Medicine. JAMA. 200;284:1085-1092
2. S Kaplan, A Faj, P Carr, et al. Race/Ethnicity and Success in Academic Medicine: Findings From a Longitudinal Multi-Institutional Study. Acad Med. 2018 April;93(4):616-622
3. B Beech, J Calles-Escandon, K Hairston, et al. Mentoring Programs for Underrepresented Minority Faculty in Academic Medical Centers: A Systematic Review of the Literature. Academic Medicine. 2013 April;88(4):541-549
4. A Palepu, P Carr, R Friedman, et al. Minority Faculty and Academic Rank in Medicine. JAMA. 1998;280(9):767-771.
5. K Page, L Castillo-Page, S Wright. Faculty Diversity Programs in U.S. Medical Schools and Characteristics Associated with Higher Faculty Diversity. Acad Med. 2011 Oct;86(10):1221-1228.
6. U Blakcstock. Why Black doctors like me are leaving faculty positions in academic medical centers. 2020. <https://www.statnews.com/2020/01/16/black-doctors-leaving-faculty-positions-academic-medical-centers/comment-page-1/>
7. <https://psychnews.psychiatryonline.org/doi/full/10.1176/appi.pn.2021.3.9>

In this tool kit, we address recruitment for:

- Positions, both faculty positions and those of leadership (i.e. New hires, Division Head, Chief Medical Officer, etc.)
- Committee membership (at the institution level, for national meetings, etc.)
- Speakership

We also provide tools for reporting and tracking of your recruitment efforts.

Disclaimer: We have provided links throughout this tool to websites that are not affiliated with the AAMC. We do not endorse these sites but have provided them such that this tool can hopefully be as inclusive of a tool as possible and provide additional details and information should you need them.

Outline – Recruitment for Positions



Search committee membership



Recruiting diverse applicants

A photograph of a business meeting. Several people in professional attire are gathered around a table. One person is pointing at a tablet displaying a document with charts and text. Another person is holding a smartphone. A coffee cup is visible on the table. The scene is dimly lit, with a dark overlay on the right side.

Search Committees

Search Committee Membership and Tools - Search Committee Composition

Ensure diverse search committee and applicant pools

- *Equity expert* - on committee (ideally) or as advisor
- *Ensure gender balance and racial/ethnic diversity (URMs)* among committee members.
 - Should there not be sufficient diversity from within a group then seek diversity from members external to the group
- *Aim for 40%* representation from either gender and > 1 URM on the committee.
 - There is generally limited evidence-based information on ideal committee composition. We believe more diversity is better and thus have stated to aim for 40% from either gender.
 - In November 2012, the European Commission proposed legislation to increase the number of women on corporate boards by 40% in publicly listed companies.¹
- *Consider other forms of diversity when forming committees*, e.g. different abilities, ranks, gender identities, LGBTQ+, etc.

Search Committee Membership and Tools - *Search Committee Composition*

Ensure diverse search committee and applicant pool

- *Ensure diverse applicant pool*
 - Heilman¹ found that when women composed 25% or less (i.e. no more than two) of the applicants in a pool of eight, they were viewed as less qualified than male applicants and as being more stereotypically female on gender-related adjectival scales than when women made up at least 37.5% of the pool.

¹ Heilman M. The Impact of Situational Factors on Personnel Decisions Concerning Women: Varying the Sex Composition of the Applicant Pool. *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance* 1980;26:386-95.

Search Committee Membership and Tools – *Equity and Unconscious Bias Training*

Provide equity and unconscious bias training for all members of the committee

- We can consider implicit bias as a habit. Like any habit, *becoming aware of the habit and being motivated to change* are necessary first steps.
 - Investigate your unconscious biases by taking an Implicit Association Test.
<https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/>
 - The IAT is a well accepted tool for measuring unconscious biases; it is NOT *correlated with conscious bias.*

Search Committee Membership and Tools – *Equity and Unconscious Bias Training*

Utilize AAMC unconscious bias resources

- <https://www.aamc.org/what-we-do/equity-diversity-inclusion/learning>
- “What you don’t know: The science of unconscious bias in the search and recruitment process”:

<https://www.aamc.org/what-we-do/equity-diversity-inclusion/unconscious-bias-training>

Search Committee Membership and Tools

Provide toolkit to the committee with:

- Methodology to create *job descriptions*
- Advice on how to *evaluate applications* with nontraditional components
- List of interview *questions* that all candidates are asked

The next set of slides will highlight key areas for the 3 topics above with links to resources on the web.

Advertisements



Advertise for Diversity -

Job Descriptions and Job Postings

Craft the job posting thoughtfully

- Identify program and organizational needs and personnel gaps the position will meet
- Provide information about the institution and resources that would serve a diverse group of people
- Highlight your institution's commitment to diversity
- Have diversity expert review the ad
- Use inclusive, unbiased, ungendered language (utilize “all genders” instead of women and men). Resources: <http://gender-decoder.katmatfield.com>; <https://textio.com>
- Avoid prioritizing traits that are traditionally viewed as masculine

Advertise for Diversity -

Job Descriptions and Job Postings

- **Conduct an environmental scan.** Does the environment that the candidates will see support diversity? (i.e. evaluate websites, public relations materials, etc.)
- **Advertise widely** including professional societies and associations of designated groups; solicit professional organizations for names of candidates
- **Actively seek out** diverse and highly qualified candidates

Note: For internal searches, ALL positions should be internally advertised and shared with the community. This will ensure that the selection process is standardized and equitable and individuals are not just picked for roles without an appropriate search.

Advertise for Diversity -

Job Descriptions and Job Postings

Additional Resources

- <https://www.glassdoor.com/employers/blog/10-ways-remove-gender-bias-job-listings/>
- http://www.chairs-chaires.gc.ca/program-programme/equity-equite/best_practices-pratiques_exemplaires-eng.aspx#b
- Website to assist in identifying how job description language is gender-coded: <http://gender-decoder.katmatfield.com>

Evaluating Applications

When *evaluating letters of recommendation or reviewing references*, be mindful that letter writers could have used stereotypical thinking and language in creating their letters.

Letters of Recommendation

- 312 letters from faculty hires at major medical schools
- Letters for women were:
 - Shorter
 - Less record focused
 - Less professional respect (first names rather than professional titles)

Component	Men (222)	Women (89)
Standout adj. ¹	2.0/letter	1.5/ letter
Grindstone adjective ²	23%	34%
Doubt raiser ³	12%	24%
Personal life	1%	6%
Achievements	13%	3%

Trix F. Psenka C. Exploring the Color of Glass: Letters of Recommendation for Female and Male Medical Faculty. *Discourse & Society*. 2003;14(2):191-220. doi:10.1177/0957926503014002277

Stereotypical language in letters of recommendation also affects minority racial groups.

Ross DA, Boatright D, Nunez-Smith M, Jordan A, Chekroud A, Moore EZ. Differences in words used to describe racial and gender groups in Medical Student Performance Evaluations. *PLoS One*. 2017;12(8):e0181659. Published 2017 Aug 9. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0181659

Evaluating Applications

- *Identify and recognize* your own positive and negative implicit biases. Ask yourself how the candidate is similar to or different than you.
- Use *gender-decoders* when reading and writing letters of recommendation:
<https://advance.cc.lehigh.edu/news/gender-bias-calculator-letters-recommendation>
http://csw.arizona.edu/sites/default/files/avoiding_gender_bias_in_letter_of_reference_writing.pdf
- Develop review criteria in advance
- Review diversity of applicants/candidates at each stage of the search
- *Avoid counting non-productive periods* during family or medical leaves against applicants
- Thoughtfully evaluate applications with *nontraditional components*:
<https://hbr.org/2016/02/how-to-assess-a-job-candidate-who-doesnt-fit-the-mold>
<https://www.forbes.com/sites/gradsoflife/2017/04/13/employers-are-overlooking-non-traditional-candidates-and-its-costing-them/#49babe0567e7>
<https://resources.workable.com/stories-and-insights/non-traditional-candidates>

Search Committee Membership and Tools - Interview Questions

Develop a list of interview questions that all candidates are asked

- Ensure search committee is aware of illegal questions
- Some search firms will provide you lists of standardized questions to choose from
- Ask applicants what diversity and inclusion means to them and their plans for implementing diversity and inclusion in their workplace.

- Interview questions on equity and diversity

https://www.niu.edu/diversity/_files/equal-opportunity/sample-interview-questions-diversity-and-equity.pdf

- Web resources:

<https://hbr.org/2016/02/7-rules-for-job-interview-questions-that-result-in-great-hires>

Advertise for Diversity- Job Postings and Commitment to Equity Statements

- Include institutional commitment to diversity and inclusion in job posting
- Require a track record related to diversity
- Encourage candidates to speak about views on diversity and inclusion
- Consider having applicants write a commitment to equity statement

Examples of Commitment to Equity Statements:

<https://cals.cornell.edu/faculty-staff/human-resources/policies-resources/statement-contribution-diversity-equity-and-inclusion>

<https://www.uctv.tv/shows/Evaluating-Contributions-to-Diversity-Statements-Case-Studies-25943>

<http://nonprofitinclusiveness.org/examples-values-statements-commitments-diversityinclusiveness>

Interviews



Interview

- Rank selection criteria in advance to ensure unbiased, consistent and transparent selection process
- Utilize a variety of formats (*small groups, 1 on 1, town hall*)
- Determine a standard strategy for introducing candidates in public formats (*i.e. utilize formal titles*)
- Be explicit that career breaks for family or medical needs will not negatively impact the candidate and emphasize policies that support family needs and work/life balance
- Ensure diverse candidates have opportunity to engage with other diverse individuals during the interview process
- Respect candidate's privacy, avoid personal questions

Hiring



Hiring Decisions

- Establish gender balance among faculty decision makers
- Candidates with the most years of experience are not necessarily the most qualified
- Encourage the committee to be inclusive instead of exclusive when composing the final list of applicants
- Provide report of the entire selection process with a focus on how underrepresented groups were included (*this should be reviewed and approved by diversity expert*)
- Ensure transparency in hiring
- Combat “Similarity Bias” (seeing others similar to you in a favorable light). This can be done by asking, “How is this candidate like me?” If there is a lot in common, selection may be based on unconscious bias.

Hiring Process Guides That We Selected From Online Resources

http://diversity.berkeley.edu/sites/default/files/recruiting_a_more_diverse_workforce_uhs.pdf

<https://www.cpp.edu/~officeofequity/documents/Faculty%20Hiring%20Workshop%20Manual.pdf>

<http://www.wvu.edu/eoo/docs/hiringguide.pdf>

<https://www.ius.edu/diversity/files/best-practices.pdf>

<https://medschool.duke.edu/sites/default/files/2021-08/ODI%20recruitment%20toolkit.pdf>

References

1. Carnes M, Devine PG, Baier Manwell L, et al. The effect of an intervention to break the gender bias habit for faculty at one institution: a cluster randomized, controlled trial. *Acad Med* 2015;90:221-30.
2. Carr PL, Gunn C, Raj A, Kaplan S, Freund KM. Recruitment, Promotion, and Retention of Women in Academic Medicine: How Institutions Are Addressing Gender Disparities. *Womens Health Issues* 2017;27:374-81.
3. Heilman M. The Impact of Situational Factors on Personnel Decisions Concerning Women: Varying the Sex Composition of the Applicant Pool. *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance* 1980;26:386-95.
4. Ibrahim H, Stadler DJ, Archuleta S, Cofrancesco J, Jr. Twelve tips to promote gender equity in international academic medicine. *Med Teach* 2017:1-7.
5. Isaac C, Lee B, Carnes M. Interventions that affect gender bias in hiring: a systematic review. *Acad Med* 2009;84:1440-6.
6. Westring A, McDonald JM, Carr P, Grisso JA. An Integrated Framework for Gender Equity in Academic Medicine. *Acad Med* 2016;91:1041-4.
7. Galloway G, Schmitt S, Herman ST, La Roche S. Gender Disparity and Potential Strategies for Improvement in Neurology and Clinical Neurophysiology. *J Clin Neurophysiol*. 2020;37(5):446-454.
8. <https://neuroladership.com/your-brain-at-work/seeds-model-biases-affect-decision-making/#:~:text=Similarity%20Bias%20%E2%80%94%20We%20prefer%20what,similar%20in%20a%20favorable%20light.>

Committee (Non-search) Membership

- Recommend composition of committees strive for a *minimum of 40%* of each male and female leadership, as well as > 1 underrepresented minority (URM) on the committee. Note: Tracking for URMs should be done separate from tracking for gender equity, i.e. goal should be to achieve equity in representation from women and URMs, not one or the other.
- Annually, senior leadership in conjunction with diversity expert should review committee composition and should track results
- Committees lacking the minimum 40% of either gender and ≤ 1 URM will be tracked and noted and one of the following will be pursued:
 - Add additional members from the underrepresented gender and/or URM groups
 - Appoint a deputy chairperson from the underrepresented group
 - Seek members from underrepresented group elsewhere within the University
 - Recommend changes to composition (limit terms, limit ex-officio members, broaden eligibility from more junior members)
 - Schedule and organize meetings that work for as many staff as possible with consideration to staff who have caring responsibilities
- Annual reviews
- Committees with less than 40% of either gender or ≤ 1 URM should report how they plan to mitigate that or what has been done previously to increase representation from underrepresented gender and URMs

References

1. Carr PL, Gunn C, Raj A, Kaplan S, Freund KM. Recruitment, Promotion, and Retention of Women in Academic Medicine: How Institutions Are Addressing Gender Disparities. *Womens Health Issues* 2017;27:374-81.
2. Carnes M, Devine PG, Baier Manwell L, et al. The effect of an intervention to break the gender bias habit for faculty at one institution: a cluster randomized, controlled trial. *Acad Med* 2015;90:221-30.
3. Isaac C, Lee B, Carnes M. Interventions that affect gender bias in hiring: a systematic review. *Acad Med* 2009;84:1440-6.
4. <https://policies.westernsydney.edu.au/document/view.current.php?id=324&version=1>
5. https://www.westernsydney.edu.au/__data/assets/pdf_file/0010/1258075/WSU_WGEA_Compliance_Report_PUBLIC_18_07_2017_signedSH.pdf

Speaker and Conference Recruitment Planning

- *Create a registry of potential female speakers, keynote, and session chairs*
- *Ensure that all aspects of the conference take into account gender equity*
 - Who is on the planning committee?
 - Who are the chairs?
 - What is the make up of proposed speakers? (*recommend looking at total speakers as well as keynote speakers*)
 - Pay attention to marketing materials (pamphlets, websites, etc.) ensuring that conference materials take a diverse and equitable approach to representing men and women and ensuring roles equally spread out (e.g., men and women pictured as physicians)
 - Track results and publicly report them
 - If disparities exist, explore why and prepare a plan to improve gender diversity

References

1. Burden M, Frank MG, Keniston A, et al. Gender disparities in leadership and scholarly productivity of academic hospitalists. *J Hosp Med* 2015;10:481-5.
2. Carr PL, Gunn C, Raj A, Kaplan S, Freund KM. Recruitment, Promotion, and Retention of Women in Academic Medicine: How Institutions Are Addressing Gender Disparities. *Womens Health Issues* 2017;27:374-81.
3. Casadevall A. Achieving Speaker Gender Equity at the American Society for Microbiology General Meeting. *MBio* 2015;6:e01146.
4. <http://www.sciencemag.org/careers/2015/07/countering-gender-bias-conferences>

Reporting

Monitor

- Monitor and report on gender equity results (see checklists at end of toolkit)
- Conference Tracking Sheet
 - Recruitment Requiring Search Committee - Tracking Sheet
 - Committee Membership - Tracking Sheet

House

House high level reporting documents in a transparent and accessible format (i.e. website)

Basic Steps to Achieving Gender Equity in Recruitment – Recruitment Requiring Search Committee		
Search Committee	Yes	No
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is gender balance among the committee members. [Should there not be sufficient diversity from within a group then seek diversity from members external to the group] 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Equity/diversity expert will serve on the planning committee or at serve as an advisor to the committee. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All committee members have (or will have received) unconscious bias training. See toolkit for resources. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Selection committee has access to a recruitment toolkit with methodology on how to create job description, evaluating applications with nontraditional components, list of interview questions 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Committee has or will review diversity of applicants at each stage and will plan accordingly when there is a lack of gender equity/representation. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Criteria for selection have been determined in advance. 		
Job description/job posting/advertisement		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diversity expert has reviewed job posting. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inclusive unbiased, ungendered language has been utilized throughout the job description. Have avoided prioritizing traits that are traditionally masculine. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Applicants required to submit a track record related to diversity (i.e. commitment to equity statement) and is stated in the job posting. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Advertise widely including professional societies and associations of designated groups. 		
Interview		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Selection criteria ranked in advance to ensure unbiased, consistent, and transparent selection process. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Variety of formats are planned for interview (small groups, one on one, town hall). 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Candidates explicitly told that career breaks for family/medical leave will not negatively impact candidate 		
Hiring Decisions/Reporting		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report provided of the entire selection process with a focus on how women and other underrepresented groups were identified. Should be reviewed and approved by diversity expert. [Examine candidates invited, those who declined, final candidates, etc.] Report of selection committee composition 		

References:

Ibrahim H, Stadler DJ, Archuleta S, Cofrancesco J, Jr. Twelve tips to promote gender equity in international academic medicine. *Med Teach* 2017;1-7.
 Westring A, McDonald JM, Carr P, Grisso JA. An Integrated Framework for Gender Equity in Academic Medicine. *Acad Med* 2016;91:1041-4.
 Carr PL, Gunn C, Raj A, Kaplan S, Freund KM. Recruitment, Promotion, and Retention of Women in Academic Medicine: How Institutions Are Addressing Gender Disparities. *Womens Health Issues* 2017;27:374-81.
 Carnes M, Devine PG, Baier Manwell L, et al. The effect of an intervention to break the gender bias habit for faculty at one institution: a cluster randomized, controlled trial. *Acad Med* 2015;90:221-30.
 Isaac C, Lee B, Carnes M. Interventions that affect gender bias in hiring: a systematic review. *Acad Med* 2009;84:1440-6.
<http://www.hr.uwa.edu.au/policies/policies/equity/gender-balance-on-committees-policy> Accessed December 10, 2017.

Basic Steps to Achieving Speaker Diversity Balance		
VIP local site planning group	Yes	No
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> VIP committee has developed a speaker policy that addresses goals for speaker diversity. For example, “The conference committee wants to achieve a gender balance of speakers that roughly reflects that of its audience.” [PUT HERE] 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is diversity among the Site VIP planning committee. [Consider having a diversity expert serve on the planning committee or review process.] 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Committee has reviewed the speaker data (with breakdown by gender/race/ethnicity/and other aspects of diversity) from the previous year (if applicable)? <u>Please see conference data tracking sheet.</u> 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Speaker policy is visible and publicly available and sent in invitations to speakers/attendees. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Site planning committee has developed a database/list of qualified, diverse speakers. Each site should list all Assistant level faculty (certain number of years?), compile a list of interests, and previous VIP opportunities. Site VIP committee should review list ensuring diversity of gender, race/ethnicity, and topic. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Site VIP committee has determined in advance outline of each site visit, clearly articulates outline. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Speaker introductions for presentations: Ensure each site follows a standard template for introductions with official titles (Dr. X) and similar templates to outline accomplishments. 		
Annual Reporting		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Each site will complete the VIP tracking sheet. <u>Please see VIP data tracking sheet.</u> [Examine those invited, those who declined, final speakers examining by role (if applicable)] Reviewed annual reporting with <u>action plan</u> as needed for speaker diversity. Reporting presented to VIP subcommittee 		

References:

Casadevall A. Achieving Speaker Gender Equity at the American Society for Microbiology General Meeting. MBio 2015;6:e01146.
 Burden M, Frank MG, Keniston A, et al. Gender disparities in leadership and scholarly productivity of academic hospitalists. J Hosp Med 2015;10:481-5.
 Carr PL, Gunn C, Raj A, Kaplan S, Freund KM. Recruitment, Promotion, and Retention of Women in Academic Medicine: How Institutions Are Addressing Gender Disparities. Womens Health Issues 2017;27:374-81.
<http://www.sciencemag.org/careers/2015/07/countering-gender-bias-conferences> Accessed December 10, 2017.
 Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu

Basic Steps to Achieving Speaker Gender Balance		
Conference planning	Yes	No
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is gender balance among the meeting or conference planners/committee. [Consider having a diversity expert serve on the planning committee] 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Committee has reviewed the speaker data (with breakdown by gender) from the previous meeting or conference? [This should include number of men and women for: keynote speakers, speakers, leadership of interest groups or other similar events, attendee makeup of the conference, membership in the professional society, department, etc.] <u>Please see conference data tracking sheet.</u> 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Committee/organization/group has developed a speaker policy that addresses goals for gender equity. For example, “The conference committee wants to achieve a gender balance of speakers that roughly reflects that of its audience.” 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Speaker policy is visible and publicly available and reported to the public including websites, advertisements, and/or invitations that are sent to speakers/attendees. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Planning committee has developed a database of qualified, diverse speakers, both regionally and nationally. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Planning committee has worked with public relations/advertising to ensure that marketing materials have diverse and equitable representation of men and women, paying attention to roles they play in the advertisements [i.e. if pictures of providers utilized ensuring that men and women are pictured in these roles] 		
Annual Reporting		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Planning committee completed annual report. <u>Please see conference data tracking sheet.</u> [Examine those invited, those who declined, final speakers examining by role (if applicable)] Reviewed annual reporting with <u>action plan</u> as needed for gender equity. <u>See example of action plan for increased gender equity/diversity.</u> Reporting presented to organization leadership (i.e. executive committee, high level leadership) 		

References:

Casadevall A. Achieving Speaker Gender Equity at the American Society for Microbiology General Meeting. MBio 2015;6:e01146.
 Burden M, Frank MG, Keniston A, et al. Gender disparities in leadership and scholarly productivity of academic hospitalists. J Hosp Med 2015;10:481-5.
 Carr PL, Gunn C, Raj A, Kaplan S, Freund KM. Recruitment, Promotion, and Retention of Women in Academic Medicine: How Institutions Are Addressing Gender Disparities. Womens Health Issues 2017;27:374-81.
<http://www.sciencemag.org/careers/2015/07/countering-gender-bias-conferences> Accessed December 10, 2017.
 Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu

Basic Steps to Achieving Gender Equity in Recruitment to Committees		
Composition of Committee Members	Yes	No
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Formalize a process for invitation for committee members with high consideration for open invitation to key stakeholders. If no, document rationale for appointing members. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is gender balance among the committee members. [Should there not be sufficient diversity from within a group then seek diversity from members external to the group] Goal: Minimum of 40% for either gender. 		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All committee members have (or will have received) unconscious bias training. <u>See toolkit for resources.</u> 		
Annual Committee Review		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Senior leadership in conjunction with equity/diversity expert have reviewed committee composition (Date: _____) 		
Reporting		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Committee composition will be publically reported as well as how membership is selected (appointed, elected, etc.) Committees lacking the minimum 40% of either gender will prepare report on how they will increase the representation of the underrepresented group to senior level/executive level leadership 		
Reporting for Committees lacking the minimum 40% of either gender will:		
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Add additional members from the underrepresented gender Appoint a deputy chairperson from the underrepresented gender Seek members from the underrepresented group elsewhere within the organization Recommend changes to composition (limit terms, limit ex-officio members, broaden eligibility for more junior members) declined, final candidates, etc.] Schedule and organize meetings that work for as many staff as possible with consideration for staff who have caring responsibilities 		

References:

Carr PL, Gunn C, Raj A, Kaplan S, Freund KM. Recruitment, Promotion, and Retention of Women in Academic Medicine: How Institutions Are Addressing Gender Disparities. *Womens Health Issues* 2017;27:374-81.

Carnes M, Devine PG, Baier Manwell L, et al. The effect of an intervention to break the gender bias habit for faculty at one institution: a cluster randomized, controlled trial. *Acad Med* 2015;90:221-30.

Isaac C, Lee B, Carnes M. Interventions that affect gender bias in hiring: a systematic review. *Acad Med* 2009;84:1440-6.
<https://policies.westernsydney.edu.au/document/view.current.php?id=324&version=1>
https://www.westernsydney.edu.au/_data/assets/pdf_file/0010/1258075/WSU_WGEA_Compliance_Report_PUBLIC_18_07_2017_signedSH.pdf
<http://www.hr.uwa.edu.au/policies/policies/equity/gender-balance-on-committees-policy>

Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu

Committee Membership - Tracking Sheet				
Committee Characteristics	Total N	Male (N, %)	Female (N, %)	URM* (N, %)
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Composition of committee 				
Reporting			Yes	No
Recruitment statistics above are publicly reported (i.e. placed onto website, reports to senior level leadership)				
Action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity (if applicable)				
Report and action plan shared with executive level leadership (if applicable)				
Committee members have received unconscious bias training				

URM = Under-represented minority;

*Tracking for underrepresented minorities should be done separate from tracking for gender equity (i.e. goal should be to achieve equity in representation from women and URMs, not one or the other)

Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu

Recruitment requiring search committee - tracking sheet				
Selection Committee	Total N	Male (N, %)	Female (N, %)	URM* (N, %)
• Composition of search committee				
• Composition of all applicants – [if lack of diversity, action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity]				
• Composition of applicants invited for in person interview [add additional rows as needed for each step in selection process] [if lack of diversity, action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity]				
Reporting			Yes	No
Recruitment statistics above are publicly reported (i.e. placed onto website, reports to senior level leadership)				
Report provided of the entire selection process with a focus on how women and other underrepresented groups were identified.				
Diversity/equity assessed at each key step of process				
Action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity (if applicable)				
Report and action plan shared with executive level leadership				

URM = Under-represented minority;

*Tracking for underrepresented minorities should be done separate from tracking for gender equity (i.e. goal should be to achieve equity in representation from women and URMs, not one or the other)

Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu

Conference tracking sheet				
Year: _____	Total N	Male (N, %)	Female (N, %)	URM* (N, %)
• Membership of organization, department, division, or other group [If there is not gender equity, examine the reason why]				
• Planning committee composition				
• Total speakers (for annual conference, or if reoccurring throughout the year include total for the year) INVITED; [track declined invitations and find out why]				
• Total speakers (for annual conference, or if reoccurring throughout the year include total for the year) ACCEPTED				
• Keynote/featured speakers (typically if at a conference they are the only speakers at that time, somehow highlighted as different from other speakers)				
• Focus group/interest group leads (or similar type of group lead)				
Reporting			Yes	No
Conference statistics are publicly reported (i.e. placed onto website, conference marketing materials, annual report for organization)				
Conference statistics compared to previous years				
Action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity (if applicable)				
Report and action plan shared with executive level leadership/high level leadership				

URM = Under-represented minority;

*Tracking for underrepresented minorities should be done separate from tracking for gender equity (i.e. goal should be to achieve equity in representation from women and URMs, not one or the other)

Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu

We want your feedback!

We aim for this toolkit to be a “living” document improved by real-time constructive feedback.

**Please send feedback on this toolkit and our checklists and reporting tools to:

- Marisha Burden, MD - Marisha.Burden@cuanschutz.edu
- Amira del Pino-Jones, MD - Amira.delPino-Jones@cuanschutz.edu
- Reem Hanna, MD - Reem.Hanna@cuanschutz.edu
- Scott Saunders, MD - Scott.Saunders@cuanschutz.edu

Original Toolkit & Toolkit Update

Authors

This toolkit was created in 2018 and updated for re-release in 2023.

Original Toolkit Authors

- Marisha Burden, MD - Marisha.Burden@cuanschutz.edu
- Amira del Pino-Jones, MD - Amira.delPino-Jones@cuanschutz.edu
- Michelle Shafer, MD - mshafer@bwh.harvard.edu
- Sangini Sheth, MD - Sangini.sheth@yale.edu
- Kathryn Rexrode, MD - Krexrode@bwh.harvard.edu

Toolkit Update Authors

- Marisha Burden, MD - Marisha.Burden@cuanschutz.edu
- Amira del Pino-Jones, MD - Amira.delPino-Jones@cuanschutz.edu
- Reem Hanna, MD - Reem.Hanna@cuanschutz.edu
- Scott Saunders, MD - Scott.Saunders@cuanschutz.edu



Tomorrow's Doctors, Tomorrow's Cures

Learn

Serve

Lead

Association of
American Medical Colleges