Strategies for Advancing the Careers of Women of Color in Academic Medicine

Part 2 – Individual Strategies
Original Authors of the 2015 Toolkit:

- Archana Chatterjee, MD, PhD
- Chiquita Collins, PhD
- Linda Chaudron, MD
- Ashleigh Moses, MA
- Barbara Fivush, MD
- Laura Castillo-Page, PhD
- Diana Lautenberger, MAT
Authors of the 2022 Toolkit:

- Linda Barry, MD
- Kimberly Bibb, MD
- Valeria Cohran, MD
- Toi Harris, MD
- Sonya Jacobs, MS
- Diana Lautenberger, MA
- Monica Lypson, MD

- Kenya McNeal-Trice, MD
- Agatha Parks-Savage, MD
- Deborah Paul, MD
- Sandra Quezada, MD
- Mithu Sen, MD
- Sharon White
Background

- Women of Color (WOC)
  - Referring to women with marginalized racial identities
  - Not a monolithic term – individual challenges and needs may differ, and those differences must be recognized and addressed
  - Barriers to career advancement often intersect at gender and race
Distinction between WOC and URM

• **Women of Color** – a term used to reflect a sense of solidarity among women with multiple, layered identities that intersect with each other, derived from shared experiences, history, social relations, and structures of power (unearned privilege conferred systematically).
  - Referring to women with marginalized racial identities
  - Not a monolithic term – individual challenges and needs may differ, and those differences must be recognized and addressed
  - Barriers to career advancement often intersect at gender and race

• **Underrepresented in Medicine** - refers to racial and ethnic populations that are underrepresented in the medical profession relative to their numbers in the general population.
Background (...)

- WOC are underrepresented at higher ranks and leadership in academic medicine
- Important to understand the relationships between an individual’s multiple identities
- Limited attention is given to WOC and their specific challenge
- **Double jeopardy** (between race and gender)
  - Women of color's experiences of discrimination are additive, or compounded, such that they face double the challenges as individuals who are stigmatized on only one identity dimension
• WOC have very particular problems in the workplace

• **Intersectionality** - an analytical approach for understanding the ways multiple identities that individuals embody (i.e., gender, class, race, immigration status, ethnicity) overlap and combine with one another to contribute to unique experiences of disadvantaged and privileged.

• Gendered Racism:
  – WOC regularly endure comments about their professionalism, authority, competency, and scholarly expertise by their white male coworkers
Background (...)

• WOC are a historically marginalized group
  ▪ Historically marginalized: “Individuals, groups, and communities that have historically and systematically been denied access to services, resources, and power relationships across economic, political, and cultural dimensions as a result of systemic, durable, and persistent racism, discrimination, and other forms of oppression”
Background (...)

• What got us here?
  ▪ Decades of “benign neglect”, both conscious and unconscious bias, lack of role models, sponsorship and mentorship, etc.

• What will change things?
  ▪ Concerted action from both institutions and individuals, based on a strategic plan designed to remedy the current situation.
Minority Tax

- **Definition:**
  
  “The extra, financially uncompensated duties and responsibilities that minorities are asked to perform to increase diversity at their institutions, such as serving on a search committee that would otherwise be all White.”

- These institutional strategies should not be placed upon WOC or POC to advance unless they will be both recognized and compensated (i.e., increased pay, extra time, titles, etc.)

- There must be formal recognized policy, re-training, and education to ensure that those old practices are not continued so that marginalized groups may finally benefit and stop performing uncompensated labor.
History of the Term: “WOC”

- The political term “women of color” surfaced in the violence against women movement in the late 1970s to unify all women experiencing multiple layers of marginalization with race and ethnicity as a common issue.

- Loretta J. Scott gives a history of the term here: https://youtu.be/82vl34mi4Iw
  - Note: There is no universal definition for WOC, and criticism has highlighted issues surrounding the inclusivity of the term, however, it is being used to describe women with multiple marginalized identities.

- Combahee River Collective:
History of the Term: “WOC”

- The political term “women of color” surfaced in the violence against women movement in the late 1970s to unify all women experiencing multiple layers of marginalization with race and ethnicity as a common issue.

- Loretta J. Scott gives a history of the term here: https://youtu.be/82vl34mi4Iw
  - Note: There is no universal definition for WOC, and criticism has highlighted issues surrounding the inclusivity of the term, however, it is being used to describe women with multiple marginalized identities.

Hostile Obstacle Course

CAREER ACHIEVEMENTS

RETENTION

“What’s the matter? It’s the same distance!”
How the hostile obstacle course shows up in the data

While the racial and ethnic diversity of the graduate pool increased, women graduates were slightly more diverse than men graduates in both 2013-2014 and 2018-2019.

Source: State of Women in Academic Medicine, AAMC, 2020
The proportion of women from an underrepresented-in-medicine race and/or ethnic group was 12% in 2009 and 13% in 2018.

Source: State of Women in Academic Medicine, AAMC, 2020
How the hostile obstacle course shows up in the data

The greatest proportions of URiM women faculty were at the assistant professor and instructor ranks.

Source: State of Women in Academic Medicine, AAMC, 2020
Pause for Activity

If you are using this toolkit with a discussion group, pause here to conduct Worksheet Topic 1: Introductions and Icebreaker
Goals and Advancement

• Goals:
  ▪ Raise awareness of the factors affecting the careers of WOC in academic medicine.
  ▪ Offer recommendations that may assist WOC faculty in navigating their careers and obtaining the support needed to advance.

• Objectives:
  ▪ Identify the primary factors affecting the careers of WOC in academic medicine.
  ▪ Recommend strategies institutions can implement/enhance to change the status quo for WOC in academic medicine.
  ▪ Acknowledgement of the issues impacting WOC must come from institutional policies and corrective actions
Individual Actions

- Topics relevant to actions WOC can and should take as individuals to be active participants in the advancement of their own careers:
  1. Seek appropriate mentors, sponsors allies, and role models.
  2. Develop a network of supporters internally and externally.
  3. Attend career development seminars and workshops.
  4. Recognize bias, macro and microaggressions, and discrimination and learn how to respond to them.
  5. Develop resilience, motivation, and confidence in approaching negotiations.
  6. Practice work-life integration.
  7. Acquire financial savvy – understand personal/professional finances as well as how budgets work and organizational finances.
Individual Actions (...)

1. Speak up and advocate for yourself!
   - When interrupted, you may speak up – “Excuse me, I was still speaking.”
   - When having your credentials challenged – “I am a [professor of philosophy] and have been knowledgeable in my field for [10+ years].”

2. Use EQ (Emotional Intelligence)
   - Definition: “[the] capacity to be aware of, control, and express one's emotions, and to handle interpersonal relationships judiciously and empathetically.”

3. Pay it forward.
   - Share lessons learned and create a sense of community to help the next generation of WOC scholars.
Seek Appropriate Mentors, Sponsors and Role Models

- Identify diverse, effective mentors (internal & external), initiate mentoring relationships, be an active listener, follow through with mentor recommendations, “check-in” regularly for feedback
- Recognize differences between mentors and sponsors
- Cultivate sponsors likely to assist in career advancement
- Find and emulate suitable role models, keeping diversity and equity in mind, not all senior faculty are good mentors
  - See GWIMS Mentor and Mentee Toolkits for guidance.
Seek Appropriate Mentors, Sponsors and Role Models (…)

- Recognize responsibilities as a mentee to promote a productive relationship, mentees are not passive
- Identify goals that the mentorship relationship can advance
- Recognize when mentorship is unhelpful and develop a skillset to leave the relationship
  - It is important to know compatibility and one’s boundaries

See GWIMS Mentor and Mentee Toolkits for guidance.
Coach vs. Mentor

COACHES
Co-create actionable steps with client
Professionally trained to tackle any domain of life
Can be formally engaged
Strategize methods to handle various situations

MENTORS
Provide advice based on personal experiences
Experienced in specific role or industry
Help based on goodwill, usually on an informal basis
Take a “Here is what I did” approach

Encourage self-improvement
Provide a safe setting for honest sharing
Coach vs. Mentor (...)

- One of the fundamental differences between *coaching* and *mentoring* is the primary skill used during the engagement: advising (sharing one’s own experiences) vs asking powerful questions.
  - For *coaching* within the University of Michigan, we do ask that our coaches have both the skills to coach within any domain of life and higher education, we also ensure that they have a certain level of lived professional experience that aligns with the needs of their clients.
  - For *mentoring*, having experience with a particular skill set is most effective although mentoring doesn’t require that the mentor have the exact job experience – it is more about skill set and shared experiences.
Coach vs. Mentor (...)

Group on Women in Medicine and Science (GWIMS)
Coach vs. Mentor (...)

• Issues to consider:
  ▪ How to find a coach
  ▪ Cost of a coach - paid for by the institution? Negotiate in contract vs. budget to pay out of pocket
  ▪ When is the appropriate time to get a coach?

• One of the most important things to remember, is that the primary goal in both engagements is the goal to create a safe environment that encourages self-improvement
## Mentor vs. Sponsor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentors</th>
<th>Sponsors - the key to advancement!</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Can sit at any level in the hierarchy</td>
<td>Must be senior manager with influence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide emotional support, feedback on how to improve, and other advice</td>
<td>Give protégé exposure to other executives who may help their careers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Serve as role models</td>
<td>Make sure their people are considered for promising opportunities and challenging assignments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strive to increase mentees’ sense of competence and self-worth</td>
<td>Protect their protégé from negative publicity or damaging contact with senior executives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on mentees’ personal and professional development</td>
<td>Fight to get their people promoted</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mentor vs. Sponsor (…)

  - Mentors offer ‘psychosocial’ support for personal and professional development, plus career help that includes advice and coaching. Sponsors, on the other hand, openly campaign for career advancement, often putting their own reputations on the line.
    - People may enjoy mentoring more but they are more likely to get ahead through sponsorship.
    - While both a mentor and a sponsor may want to give you an opportunity, a sponsor can give you the opportunity—or work one of his or her own relationships to make it so.
Pause for Activity

If you are using this toolkit with a discussion group, pause here to conduct
Worksheet Topic 2: Mentor, Coach and Sponsor
How to Develop a Network of Supports—
“Think Outside the Box”

- Engage supervisors, subordinates, and peers (Internal & External)
- Offer mutual support – barter/trade skills, expertise, opportunities
- Seek out diverse champions and allies
- Involve family, friends, and community
- Publicize goals and metrics for success

- Encourage trusted supporters to hold you accountable
- Delegate tasks, ensuring accountability
- Employ appropriate staff for unskilled tasks
- Demonstrate gratitude to supporters
Attend Career Development Seminars and Workshops

• Seek out internal and external professional/leadership development programs designed specifically for women and minorities e.g.
  ▪ AAMC Early Career and Mid-Career Women Faculty Professional Development Seminars
  ▪ AAMC Mid-Career Minority Faculty Seminar
  ▪ Similar programs offered by professional societies
• Focus on areas of weakness
Attend Career Development Seminars and Workshops (...)

- Identify funding sources, application process, and logistical hurdles to overcome - seeking funding from leadership, negotiated in the contract
- Ask mentors and supporters for advice regarding programs
- Discuss the relevancy of content with prior attendees and link to short and long-term career goals
- Garner support to attend career development programs
Implicit or Unconscious Bias

- Bias influences not only individuals’ perceptions and attitudes but also their actions and behaviors.

- **Implicit or unconscious bias**: Attitudes or stereotypes that are unintentional, automatic, robust, pervasive, and typically triggered by situational cues (e.g., a person’s skin color, manner of speech, cultural attire).

- **The Implicit Association Test**: Developed by social psychologists Tony Greenwald and Mahzarin Banaji, to uncover and assess implicit biases across a range of topics, including race, gender, weight, sexuality, and religion.
Gender Bias Differs by Race

• Bias influences not only individuals’ perceptions and attitudes but also their actions and behaviors.

• WOC face unique biases that do not affect white women, e.g., being mistaken for janitors, assistants

• The multiplicity nature of WOC identities subject them to systemic and individual barriers, such as, but not limited to:
  ▪ Isolation
  ▪ Micro-aggressions
  ▪ Racial stereotypes
  ▪ “Minority tax”
  ▪ Discrimination
Pause for Activity

If you are using this toolkit with a discussion group, pause here to conduct Worksheet Topic 3: Experiencing Bias and Healing
Barriers to Promotion

• Lack of (and how to get support for these):
  ▪ Networking opportunities
  ▪ Mentors/sponsors
  ▪ Same-race, same-gender role models
  ▪ High-visibility, Women of Color leaders
  ▪ Understanding the process and criteria for promotion
  ▪ Protected time for research
  ▪ Leadership and development opportunities
Informal Networks and Women of Color

- Household and parenting duties
- “Minority tax”, “gratitude tax”, and “distance traveled”
- Disparity in research grant funding and scholarly activity
- Gender and racial bias in promotion letter writing, student and supervisor evaluations
Informal Networks and Women of Color

- Develop a network that will assist you in ensuring invitations for grand rounds, visiting professorships, and other venues where one can further their national reputation.

- Consider the development of a website, and social media presence or make other contacts through specialty societies to further one’s network.

- Consider resources available through the American Medical Women’s Association welcomes the opportunity to identify you as an expert in your specialty and to match you with journalists and/or individuals seeking speakers for an upcoming meeting.

  - Source: https://amwa.memberclicks.net/speakers-bureau
Current State of Informal Networks among WOC

• Networking Approaches
  ▪ Blending in: Networking with those in power (i.e., white, male, colleagues at work).
  ▪ Separating: Networking with similar others (in terms of race/gender, and those outside the work environment).

• These networking approaches race by race and ethnicity among WOC
Current State of Informal Networks among WOC

- These networking approaches race by race and ethnicity among WOC
  - African-American Women
    - *Separating*: Networks high in other African-Americans, particularly African-American women
  - Latinas
    - Some *Separating* and *Blending in*: Networks high in whites, but have relatively more women than men
  - Asian Women
    - *Blending in*: Networks high in whites and men
Women with intersectional identities (specifically those of gender and race) often experience exacerbated gender discrimination in both the personal and professional spheres.

- Women with intersectional identities (specifically those of gender and race) often experience exacerbated gender discrimination in both the personal and professional spheres.

- **Source:** “Women’s Leadership and the Impact of Gender Toolkit,” 2016
Recognize bias and discrimination and learn how to respond to them:

- Institutional strategies are NOT Solutions by Themselves
- What can you do?
  - Addressing Bias at the Individual Level
  - Develop Resilience, Motivation, and Confidence in Approaching Negotiations
  - Work-Life Integration
  - Practice Work-life Integration
  - Acquire Financial Savvy
Addressing Bias at the Individual Level

- Become aware of your own biases.
  - Question first impressions and reactions.
    - Individuals and organizations that believe they are objective may exhibit the most bias.
    - Remember: Subconscious biases and stereotyping
- Familiarize yourself with the literature.
- Attitude is a choice - choose wisely.
Addressing Bias at the Individual Level (...)

• Recognize the limits of “Sisterhood”
  ▪ You cannot empathize with every struggle and obstacle, but you can sympathize. Understand the difference

• Repair relationships and resolve issues by engaging in “difficult conversations.”
  ▪ Be prepared to be uncomfortable, be open to criticism
  ▪ Determine why someone may have previously avoided and/or not enjoyed prior interactions
Addressing Bias at the Individual Level (…)

- Intention versus impact
  - While an individual may see themselves (or their actions) as innocent – understand that the impact may not reflect those good intentions
- Work together with others, not solely women, and not just on women’s issues.
- Acquiring skills on how to respond, when to respond, or if one should respond in instances of bias
Develop Resilience, Motivation, and Confidence in Approaching Negotiations

- 10 steps to negotiating respectfully and effectively
  - Identify goals and strengths
  - Commit to being in control
  - Find out if you are being treated fairly
  - Assess the negotiation environment and know the benchmarks
  - Aim high, but be realistic
  - Define your BATNA (Best Alternative to a Negotiated Agreement)
  - Focus on mutual interests

Develop Resilience, Motivation, and Confidence in Approaching Negotiations (…)

- 10 steps to negotiating respectfully and effectively
  - Tailor strategy to situation
  - Practice, practice, practice
  - Close the deal - do not take “No” for an answer
  - Know your worth, not just in dollars but in benefits, support and resources
  - Leave the door open for future negotiations
- **Source:** https://www.aamc.org/download/439462/data/toolkit-negotiations.pdf
Work-Life Integration

• Understand your benefits as it comes to parental leave as well as the care of elders

• There is a complex relationship for many WOC and work as they are often inseparable and there might be other unknown burdens.
  ▪ Ensure support from supervisors for those WOC who want to take time off and take advantage of flexible scheduling realizing there might be backlash or a perception of being less than
  ▪ Flexibility must be made mainstream for everyone

Practice Work-life Integration

- The Maslach Burnout Inventory Scale focuses on three major domains: emotional exhaustion, depersonalization, and a sense of low personal accomplishment.
  - WOC experience burnout disproportionately and differently, especially with the addition of racism
  - Aligning values with actions decreases stress
Practice Work-life Integration (…)

- Work/Career
- Home/Family
- Community/Society
- Self Mind/Body/Spirit
Practice Work-life Integration (...)

• Take the Four Domain view by:
  ▪ “Timeshifting”
    – Slow down and relax during downtime! 😊
  ▪ Practice mindfulness
  ▪ Set goals/revisit career plans
  ▪ Seek feedback from stakeholders
  ▪ Be realistic
  ▪ Increase efficiency
  ▪ Learn effective time management
Seek mutual gains in Performance and Satisfaction

Benefits to work and career

Benefits to person

Both a workplace and a personal imperative

Not “either/or” but “both and more”
Acquire Financial Savvy

Participate in faculty development which provides instruction on:
• Healthcare Finance/General Accounting Principles
• Revenue Cycle and measures of clinical productivity used to determine compensation
• Organizational Funds Flow Structures
• Strategic Planning and Budget Processes
General Accounting Principles

• Interpretation of:
  ▪ Balance Sheets
  ▪ Income Statements
  ▪ Cash Flow Analysis

• Will familiarize you with the accounting statements that assess the health of an organization at a point in time/over a time period, and the availability of cash to fund operations.
Revenue Cycle/Measurement of Clinical Productivity

Knowledge of:

1) billing and reimbursement for clinical services

2) measurement of clinical productivity as it relates to physician compensation

Physicians and leaders need to understand how ICD codes, CPT codes, and alternative payment models generate clinical revenue, how revenue can be allocated across business units, and how the Relative Value Unit is defined and then used to assess clinical productivity/determine physician compensation.
Business Development

Include:
• Strategic Planning
• Forecasting Return on Investment/Payback Period
• Sensitivity Projections

These topics are critical to justifying expansion of your enterprise or the installation of a new one
Acquire Financial Savvy-Personal Skills

Equip yourself with financial knowledge about the documents you need to protect yourself, your wealth and your family:

- Wills
- Trusts and estate planning
- Powers of attorney
- Advanced directives
- Disability insurance/long-term care insurance
- Retirement planning (IRA’s, 403b’s, etc.)
Moving up the Academic Medicine Ladder

• Knowledge of:
  ▪ Strategic Planning
  ▪ Negotiation
  ▪ Graceful Self – Promotion

• Having the right mission, vision, and values that fit the organization is key to success
Speak Up! Self-Advocacy

- WOC have double hurdle:
  - Being perceived as too aggressive
  - Proving that they are intelligent enough to warrant an audience for their ideas
  - Double bind harms organizations, depriving them of valuable ideas
- Organizations can increase WOC’s contributions by focusing less on the speaker and more on the idea
- Leaders must encourage WOC to speak up
  - Offering women the first opportunity to speak at meetings and conferences can be a powerful bias interrupter!
Emotional Intelligence and Diversity

- The Domains of Emotional Intelligence
  - Emotional Self-Awareness
  - Emotional Self-Control
  - Empathy Social-Awareness
  - Social Management

- Intellectual intelligence predicts merely 20% of leadership success, the remaining 80% includes many people-focused abilities.

- Investing in emotional intelligence → sustainable behavior changes → improve the ways in which you manage yourself and your relationships with others.
Emotional Intelligence and Diversity (…)

- Emotional Intelligence [EI] is the ability to manage oneself and to manage relationships with others (Goleman, 1995).
  - On average, women tend to have more EI than men due to social conditioning as young children
    - Example: “She is very mature for her age, compared to her brother.”
  - Leadership development should include EI training that will improve the ways in which leaders manage themselves and their relationships with others, particularly with women of color.
    - Subconscious biases also play a significant role here (e.g., race/racial stereotyping)
Pause for Activity

If you are using this toolkit with a discussion group, pause here to conduct Worksheet Topic 4: Your Emotional Intelligence
Summary

- WOC continue to be underrepresented at higher ranks and leadership in academic medicine
- The problem has multifactorial roots and needs recognition, acknowledgment and innovative actions to solve
- This toolkit outlines recommended individual actions designed to improve the situation
- Accountability and metrics, with appropriate dissemination, discussion, and plans for remediation are necessary to change the status quo
Pause for Activity

If you are using this toolkit with a discussion group, pause here to conduct Worksheet Topic 5: Making a Commitment
References

References


- Implicit Associations Tests Online. <https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/>


References (…)

References (...)

References (...)
