

Below is a compilation of teaching resources and guidelines for instruction that can be obtained through the Internet. Sample content is provided as an example of how the resources may be used to address TACCT content areas not currently well addressed at your school.

Authors: Desiree Lie, MD, MEd, Clinical Professor, Department of Family Medicine, UCI Medical Center, dalie@uci.edu
 Olivia Carter-Pokras, PhD, Associate Professor, University of Maryland School of Medicine Department of Epidemiology & Preventative Medicine, opokras@epi.umaryland.edu
 Ella Cleveland, PhD, Director Cultural Competence and Pipeline Activities, Division of Diversity Policy and Programs, AAMC, ecleveland@aamc.org

Resources/references

Domain I: Cultural Competence—Rationale, Context, and Definition

There are many **definitions of cultural competence**, but probably the most widely accepted is:

- National Center for Cultural Competence, Georgetown University, 1989. <http://gucchd.georgetown.edu/nccc/framework.html#lc>

The importance of **cultural and linguistic competence** is addressed here:

- Office of Minority Health. National Standards for Culturally and Linguistically Appropriate Services in Health Care: Final Report. Washington DC March 2001. <http://www.omhrc.gov/templates/browse.aspx?lvl=2&lvlID=15>
- The American Medical Associations (AMA) Educating Physicians on Controversies in health (EPoCH) project offers ongoing new modules for practicing physicians including videoclips on health disparities and linguistic barriers. <http://www.ama-assn.org/ama/pub/category/15416.html>
- Anderson LM, Scrimshaw SC, Fullilove MT, Fielding JE, Normand J, Task Force on Community Preventive Services. Culturally competent healthcare systems: a systematic review. Am J Prev Med 2003;24 (3S):68-79. <http://www.thecommunityguide.org/social/soc-AJPM-evrev-healthcare-systems.pdf>
- Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality. Strategies for Improving Minority Healthcare Quality. Report/Technology Assessment Number 90. AHRQ Publication No. 04-E008-02, January 2004., Rockville, MD. <http://www.ahrq.gov/clinic/epcsums/minqsum.htm>
- The CA Endowment’s Principles and Recommended Standards for Cultural Competence Education for Health Care professionals: http://www.calendow.org/reference/publications/cultural_competence.stm
- American Medical Student Association. Achieving Diversity in Dentistry and Medicine (ADDM). Available at: <http://www.amsa.org/addm/>.

To be consistent with the latest research on causes of health disparities, we would recommend that a more **socio-cultural definition of race** be used:

- Federal government: Office of Management and Budget. Standards for Maintaining, Collecting, and Presenting Federal Data on Race and Ethnicity. Federal Register Notice. October 30, 1997. <http://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/fedreg/ombdir15.html>
- Professional organizations: American Sociological Association http://www.asanet.org/galleries/default-file/asa_race_statement.pdf; American Anthropological Association <http://www.aaanet.org/stmts/racepp.htm>;

Sample content

Potential ‘Courses’

Introduce a seminar session using a cultural self-identify exercise

Doctoring courses.
 Basic science: Genetics, Pharmacology, Pathology.

Use case-based modules focusing on diversity or healthcare economics

Epidemiology and public health.

Incorporate quiz or test questions on concepts.

‘Hot topics’, eg. Ethics, Humanities, Professionalism.

Discuss biologic vs sociocultural definitions of race and potential impact on healthcare outcomes.

Within primary care clerkships and other clerkships such as EM, surgery, psychiatry and Ob. Gyn.

Introduce controversies about definition of race in basic science courses such as genetics, pharmacology and pathology.

Resources/references

American Association of Physical Anthropologists <http://www.physanth.org/positions/race.html>.

The following article contains a table defining the **term health disparity**:

- Carter-Pokras O, Baquet C. What is a health disparity? Public Health Reports. 2002;117:426-434. http://medschool.umaryland.edu/disparities/PDF/What_is_disparity.pdf

The following two **glossaries** provide definitions of terms often used when discussing cultural competency and health disparities topics:

- Kawachi I, Subramanian SV, Almeida-Filho N. A glossary for health inequalities. Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health. 2002;56:647-652 <http://jech.bmjournals.com/cgi/reprint/56/9/647>
- Krieger N. A glossary for social epidemiology. J Epidemiol Community Health 2001;55:693-700 <http://jech.bmjournals.com/cgi/reprint/55/10/693>

Clinician **self-assessment and reflection** tools include:

- Implicit Association Test is a tool to allow individuals to gain greater awareness about their own unconscious preferences and beliefs. <https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/demo/selectatest.html>
- National Center for Cultural Competence has self-assessment tools for organizations and practicing physicians: <http://gucchd.georgetown.edu/nccc/selfassessment.html>

Domain II: Key Aspects of Cultural Competence

The following sites will allow educators to identify specific data on health disparities to prepare materials for class discussions on the **epidemiology of population health**.

- The National Center for Health Statistics (NCHS) is the main source of health statistics for the nation for Healthy People 2010 (HP 2010). Key annual reports include:
 - *Health United States* (annual report on trends in health statistics): <http://www.cdc.gov/nchs/products/pubs/pubd/hs/2010/2010.htm>
 - *America's Children: Key National Indicators of Well-Being*: <http://childstats.gov/>
 - *Deaths: Final Data* and *Births: Final Data*: <http://www.cdc.gov/nchs/products/pubs/pubd/nvsr/nvsr.htm>
- Congressionally mandated annual report on health care disparities from the Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality: <http://www.qualitytools.ahrq.gov/disparitiesreport/browse/browse.aspx>
- To access other health data from the Department of Health and Human Services, use the gateway to data and statistics: <http://www.hhs-stat.net/>
- National, state and local population counts are available from the decennial Census (every ten years), and more recent population estimates are available from the American Community Survey. Both of these datasets are accessible through the Bureau of the Census: www.census.gov. The American Factfinder tab on this website is particularly useful to get your state's demographics.

Sample content

Potential 'Courses'

Integrate epidemiology data into presentations in public and population health.

Epidemiology and public health.

Doctoring course.

Give quizzes on goals of HP 2010

Any clerkship.

Evaluate evidence on achieving goals of HP 2010.

'Hot topics': health systems, diversity, ethics.

The following key references can help educators prepare class materials on Healthy People 2010, **national health goals and objectives** for the year 2010:

- <http://www.healthypeople.gov/>

Resources/references

- National baseline and monitoring data are available by age, gender, race/ethnicity; some data are available by socioeconomic status, urban/rural status, disabilities, and sexual orientation: <http://wonder.cdc.gov/data2010/>
- Data and more information on specific topics or subgroups can be found <http://www.healthypeople.gov/Data/PROGRVW/default.htm> (progress reviews); <http://www.srph.tamhsc.edu/centers/rhp2010/default.htm> (rural health); <http://www.glna.org/policy/hp2010/index.shtml> (sexual orientation); <http://www.cdc.gov/ncbddd/dh/hp2010.htm> (disabilities).

State data are available directly from:

- state centers for health statistics http://www.cdc.gov/nchs/fastats/map_page.htm
- Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC). Key annual data systems from CDC include:
 - Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System (adults 18+): <http://www.cdc.gov/brfss/>
 - Youth Risk Behavior Surveillance System (most states): <http://apps.nccd.cdc.gov/yrbss/>
 - State Cancer Registries: <http://www.cdc.gov/cancer/CancerBurden/>
- Kaiser Family Foundation also has an interactive website for state data: <http://www.statehealthfacts.org/cgi-bin/healthfacts.cgi>

Domain III: Understanding the Impact of Stereotyping on Medical Decision-Making

The following is a set of resources that allow educators to develop materials to describe the **history of stereotyping; bias, discrimination and racism**; and the effects of stereotyping:

- Smedley BD, Stith AY, Nelson AR. *Unequal Treatment: Confronting Racial & Ethnic Disparities in Health*. Institute of Medicine. 2002. <http://www.nap.edu/books/030908265X/html/> Slide sets are also available on the Institute of Medicine website: <http://www.iom.edu/?id=4475&redirect=0>
- Physicians for Human Rights. *The Right to Equal Treatment: An Action Plan to End Racial and Ethnic Disparities in Clinical Diagnosis and Treatment in the United States*. 2003. http://www.phrusa.org/research/domestic/race/race_report/report.html
- Henry J Kaiser Family Foundation and the American College of Cardiology Foundation have reviewed the evidence regarding racial/ethnic differences in cardiac care. Speaker materials, reports, and updates are available at <http://www.kff.org/whythedifference/>
- The Commonwealth Fund <http://www.cmwf.org> (see underserved populations for materials on cultural competency, reducing disparities and safety net)
- Excellent article describing the levels of racism: Jones CP. Levels of racism: A theoretic framework and a gardener's tale. *American Journal of Public Health*; Aug 2000; 90, 8; 1212-1215. <http://www.cahealthadvocates.org/docs/newsletter/2005/Levels-Of-Racism.pdf>
- The University of North Carolina's minority health project website has slidesets on these topics from Dr. Jack Geiger (2005) and other previous speakers: <http://www.minority.unc.edu/>

Key references for **disparities in health care** include:

- Congressionally mandated annual report on health care disparities from the Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality: <http://www.qualitytools.ahrq.gov/disparitiesreport/browse/browse.aspx>

Sample content

Potential 'Courses'

Play a game of Bafa Bafa to introduce a session discussing the history of racism.

Incorporate a critical appraisal of the Schulman studies on physician bias into an EBM small group session.

Doctoring course.

Pharmacology ('pharmacogenetics' concepts).

'Hot topics': Diversity, Humanities, Ethics.

Clinical clerkships: primary care, Ob.Gyn, EM, psychiatry.

Resources/references

A model of the Bafa Bafa exercise is available for purchase at: <http://www.simulationtrainingsystems.com/schools-charities/bafa.html>

Domain IV: Health Disparities and Factors Influencing Health

The following sites will allow educators to identify specific population-based data on health disparities to prepare for class discussions on the **epidemiology of health-care disparities**, factors underlying health care disparities, and demographic patterns of disparities; and provide a framework to assess communities:

- The National Center for Health Statistics (NCHS) is the main source of health statistics for the nation. Key annual reports include:
 - *Health United States* (annual report on trends in health statistics): <http://www.cdc.gov/nchs/products/pubs/pubd/hs/2010/2010.htm>
 - *America's Children: Key National Indicators of Well-Being*: <http://childstats.gov/>
 - *Deaths: Final Data* and *Births: Final Data*: <http://www.cdc.gov/nchs/products/pubs/pubd/nvsr/nvsr.htm>
- Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality. *National Healthcare Disparities Report* (annual report). <http://www.qualitytools.ahrq.gov/disparitiesreport/browse/browse.aspx>
- To access other health data from the Department of Health and Human Services, use the gateway to data and statistics: <http://www.hhs-stat.net/>

Educators can address **factors underlying health and health-care disparities** by using:

- Freeman HP. Poverty, Culture, and Social Injustice: Determinants of Cancer Disparities. *CA Cancer J Clin*, 2004; 54:72-77 <http://caonline.amcancersoc.org/cgi/reprint/54/2/72>
- Mokdad AH, Marks JS, Stroup DF, Gerberding JL. Actual Causes of Death in the United States, 2000, *JAMA*. 2004;291:1238-1245. <http://www.csdp.org/research/1238.pdf>
- Resources on the intersection of race and genetics which can be used when developing course materials to describe factors that impact health, critically appraise literature on disparities and understand social determinants of health include the January 2005 American Psychologist special issue on “Genes, Race, and Psychology in the Genome Era”: <http://www.genome.gov/13014159>
- Department of Energy’s Human Genome Project’s website has linkages to two special journal issues on race and genetics they sponsored (November 2004 *Nature Genetics*; Spring 2002 *Journal for Minority Medical Students* supplement), as well as other resources: http://www.ornl.gov/sci/techresources/Human_Genome/elsi/minorities.shtml

Sample health disparities cases developed by UC Irvine, under construction at <http://www.ucihs.uci.edu/family/facultydev/modules/index.html>

Educators can find **models of service learning** that address methods to identify community leaders, and assessment tools for service learning experiences.

- AAHE/CCPH monograph, "Creating Community-Responsive Physicians: Concepts and Models of Service-Learning in Medical Education" and other resources on service learning for medical students are available here: <http://depts.washington.edu/ccph/servicelearningres.html#Medicine>

Sample content

In grand rounds or discussion, routinely ask how management would change if a patient was of a different ethnicity, gender or belief system.

Add cases of increasing challenge for EBM classes using culture as a variable.

Assess EBM skills in Clinical Practice Exams. (CPX). Exercises

Service learning experience (community).

Potential ‘Courses’

Epidemiology.

Evidence-based medicine and Informatics

Case-based modules in any clinical course.

Any clinical clerkship: seminars and reflective exercises.

Resources/references

Domain V: Cross-Cultural Clinical Skills

Medical educators may find the following resources helpful in the development of materials to teach **cross-cultural clinical skills**:

- U.S. Department of Health and Human Resources, Office of Minority Health. *National Standards for Culturally and Linguistically Appropriate Services*. Rockville, MD: U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. <http://www.omhrc.gov/templates/browse.aspx?lvl=2&lvlID=15>
- St. Elizabeth Family Medicine Residency Program. *Providing Culturally-Sensitive Health Care; Diagnostic Checklist and Developing a Deeper Understanding*. St. Elizabeth Medical Center; Utica, NY. <http://www.semc.com/home/default.asp>
- The Henry J. Kaiser Foundation. *Compendium of Cultural Competency Initiative in Health Care*: <http://www.kff.org/uninsured/6067-index.cfm>
- The Cross Cultural Health Care Program (CCHCP) provides a comprehensive list of resources including videoclips, books and test (assessment) materials for culturally appropriate care across different groups. <http://www.xculture.org/index.cfm> for resources and <http://www.xculture.org/training/overview/cultural/assessment.html> for assessment materials
- *L-E-A-R-N Model of Cross Cultural Encounter Guidelines for Health Practitioners*. On the *Diversity Rx* website. Accessed at: <http://www.diversityrx.org/HTML/MOCPT2.htm>
- *Multicultural Health Best Practices* Overview. Includes the Kleinman questions. On the *Diversity Rx* website. Accessed at: <http://www.diversityrx.org/best/>
- Mutha S, Allen C, Welch M. *Toward Culturally Competent Care A Toolbox for Teaching Communication Strategies*. Center for the Health Professions, UCSF. <http://futurehealth.ucsf.edu/cnetwork/resources/curricula/diversity.html>
- A special issue of the *American Journal of Managed Care* outlines what patients, providers and institutions can do to eliminate healthcare disparities: <http://www.ajmc.com/ViewIssue.cfm?Menu=1&ID=1977>
- The Office of Minority Health family medicine cultural competency curriculum is available online at https://cccm.thinkculturalhealth.org/GUIs/GUI_AboutthisSite.asp The second of the three parts is perhaps the most useful for medical students (language access services). An extensive resource list and suggestions for how to adapt the materials for small groups are included. Up to 9 free CME credits are available.

National standards of practice for **medical interpreters** are available here:

http://www.ncihc.org/NCIHC_PDF/National_Standards_of_Practice_for_Interpreters_in_Health_Care.pdf

Self-learning **video case vignettes** are available for purchase from the American Academy of Family Physicians (AAFP) for the program Quality Care for Diverse Populations at <http://www.aafp.org/qualitycarevideo.xml>

Sample content

- Use standardized patients (SPs) to practice skills.
- Assess skills for use of interpreters in clinic with observation and feedback.
- Recruit real patients to provide feedback to students using standardized checklists.
- Create CPX. Cases for individuals and groups.
- Show video case vignettes for group discussion.
- Use unannounced SPs to assess student skills.

Potential ‘Courses’

- Doctoring course.
- Case-based modules.
- ‘Hot topics’: sexuality, ethics, humanities, professionalism, CAM.
- Primary care clerkships, psychiatry.
- Service learning experience (such as home visits)