GWIMS Equity Recruitment Toolkit

Your Go To Equity Guide for Recruitment: Recruitment for positions, committees (search, non-search), and speakership

Marisha Burden, MD
Amira del Pino-Jones, MD
Michelle Shafer, MD
Sangini Sheth, MD
Kathryn Rexrode, MD
Diversity drives innovation – when we limit who can contribute, we in turn limit what problems we can solve.

-Telle Whitney
Background

Studies have shown that more diverse groups of people have better problem solving skills.

In this tool kit we address recruitment for:

- **Positions**, both faculty positions and those of leadership (i.e. New hires, Division Head, Chief Medical Officer, etc.)

- **Committee membership** (at the institution level, for national meetings, etc.)

- **Speakership**

We also provide tools for reporting and tracking of your recruitment efforts.

*Disclaimer: We have provided links throughout this tool to websites that are not affiliated with the AAMC. We do not endorse these sites but have provided them such that this tool can hopefully be as inclusive of a tool as possible and provide additional details and information should you need them.*
Outline – Recruitment for Positions

- Search committee membership
- Recruiting diverse applicants
  - Job description
  - Posting the ad
  - Interview process
- Hiring decisions
Search Committee Membership and Tools - Search Committee Composition

Ensure diverse search committee and applicant pool

• **Ensure gender balance** among committee members.
  ▪ Should there not be sufficient diversity from within a group then seek diversity from members external to the group

• **Aim for 40%** representation from either gender.
  ▪ There is generally limited evidence based information on ideal committee composition. We believe more diversity is better and thus have stated to **aim** for 40% from either gender.
  ▪ In November 2012 the European Commission proposed legislation to increase the number of women on corporate boards by 40% in publicly listed companies.¹

Search Committee Membership and Tools - Search Committee Composition

Ensure diverse search committee and applicant pool

• Ensure diverse applicant pool
  - Heilman\(^1\) found that when women composed 25% or less (i.e. no more than two) of the applicants in a pool of eight, they were viewed as less qualified than male applicants and as being more stereotypically female on gender-related adjectival scales than when women made up at least 37.5% of the pool.

• Equity expert - on committee (ideally) or as advisor

\(^1\)Heilman M. the Sex 1980.
Search Committee Membership and Tools: Equity and Unconscious Bias Training

- Provide **equity and unconscious bias training** for all members of the committee.

- We can consider implicit bias as a habit. Like any habit, **becoming aware of the habit** and **being motivated to change** are necessary first steps.
  - Investigate your unconscious biases: take an Implicit Association Test.
    - [https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/](https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/)
    - Well accepted tool for measuring unconscious biases; it **is NOT correlated with conscious bias**.

- Utilize AAMC unconscious bias resources
  - [https://www.aamc.org/initiatives/diversity/learningseries/346528/howardrossinterview.html](https://www.aamc.org/initiatives/diversity/learningseries/346528/howardrossinterview.html)

- What you don’t know: The science of unconscious bias in the search and recruitment process
  - [https://www.aamc.org/members/leadership/catalog/178420/unconscious_bias.html](https://www.aamc.org/members/leadership/catalog/178420/unconscious_bias.html)
Search Committee Membership and Tools

Provide **toolkit** to committee with:

- Methodology to create **job descriptions**
- Advice on how to evaluate applications with nontraditional components
- **List of interview questions** that all candidates are asked

The next set of slides will highlight key areas for the 3 topics above with links to resources on the web.
Advertise for Diversity – Job Descriptions and Job Postings

• Identify program and organizational needs and personnel gaps the position will meet
• Provide information about the institution and resources that would serve a diverse group of people
• Include highlights about the position/institution that highlight the aim for diversity
• Have diversity expert review the ad
• Avoid prioritizing traits that are traditionally viewed as masculine
• Conduct an environmental scan. Does the environment that the candidates will see support diversity? (i.e. evaluate websites, public relations materials, etc.)
• Advertise widely including professional societies and associations of designated groups; solicit professional organizations for names of candidates
• Actively seek out diverse and highly qualified candidates
Advertise for Diversity – Job Descriptions and Job Postings

• Web resources
  ▪ https://www.glassdoor.com/employers/blog/10-ways-remove-gender-bias-job-listings/
  ▪ Website to assist in identifying how job description language is gender-coded: http://gender-decoder.katmatfield.com
Search Committee Membership and Tools-
Evaluating Applications

When **evaluating letters of recommendation or reviewing references** be mindful of stereotypical thinking and how certain words or phrases may be utilized when describing characteristics of men and women


- [http://wiseli.engr.wisc.edu/docs/BiasBrochure_3rdEd.pdf](http://wiseli.engr.wisc.edu/docs/BiasBrochure_3rdEd.pdf)

Develop **review criteria** in advance

**Review diversity** of applicants/candidates at each stage of the search

Avoid averaging non productive periods with productive periods during family or medical leaves

How to **evaluate applications** with nontraditional components:
Search Committee Membership and Tools—Evaluating Applications

Letters of Recommendation

- 312 letters for faculty hires at a major medical school
- Letters for women were:
  - Shorter
  - Less record focused
  - Less professional respect (first names rather than professional titles)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Men (222)</th>
<th>Women (89)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Standout adj.¹</td>
<td>2.0/letter</td>
<td>1.5/ letter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grindstone adjective²</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doubt raiser³</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal life</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievements</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹ Excellent, superb, outstanding, unique
² Hardworking, conscientious, dependable, dedicated, careful, meticulous.
³ Negative language, unexplained comments, faint praise

Trix and Psenka, 2003
Search Committee Membership and Tools-
Evaluating Applications

Tips for Reading and Writing Letters of Recommendation (avoiding gender bias)


Search Committee Membership and Tools - Evaluating applications with Non-traditional components

Web resources:

- https://www.slideshare.net/WorkableHR/structured-interviews-101-how-to-make-the-most-effective-interview-process-work-for-your-hiring-team

Books:

- What Works by Iris Bohnet
Search Committee Membership and Tools

Interview Questions

• Develop a list of interview questions that all candidates are asked
  ▪ Some search firms will provide you lists of standardized questions to choose from
  ▪ Interview questions on equity and diversity
    – http://faculty.medicine.umich.edu/appointments-promotions/appointment-policies/michigan-medicine-search-committee-recruitment-toolkit/behavior-based-interview-questions-related

• Web resources:
  – https://hbr.org/2016/02/7-rules-for-job-interview-questions-that-result-in-great-hires
  – https://r.search.yahoo.com/_ylt=AwrBT4VNK0VaOFwApRpXNyoA;_ylu=X3oDMTEyOGJqOWJtBGNvbwG8DYmYxBHBvcwMzBHZ0aWQDQjM4NjFfMQRzZWMDc3I/RV=2/RE=1514511309/RO=10/RU=https%3a%2f%2fwww.purdue.edu%2fhr%2fdoc%2fInterview%2520Questionnaire%2520Guide.doc/RK=2/RS=QrWrcnabshsWVYVyAUPeVLMPbC0-
Advertise for Diversity – Job Postings and Commitment to Equity Statements

Require a track record related to diversity – have applicants write a commitment to equity statement

Examples of Commitment to Equity Statements:

- https://www.brown.edu/about/administration/sheridan-center/consultations/academic-job-market-resources/diversity-statements
- http://facultydiversity.ucsd.edu/c2d/index.html
- http://tacdiversitystatement.wikispaces.com
- https://grad.uchicago.edu/sites/default/files/career-resources/DiversityStatementPresentation.pdf
- https://www.uctv.tv/shows/Evaluating-Contributions-to-Diversity-Statements-Case-Studies-25943
- http://nonprofitinclusiveness.org/examples-values-statements-commitments-diversityinclusiveness
Interview

Rank selection criteria in advance to ensure unbiased, consistent and transparent selection process

Utilize a variety of formats (small groups, 1 on 1, town hall)

• Determine a standard strategy for introducing candidates in public formats (i.e. utilize formal titles)

Be explicit that career breaks for family or medical needs will not negatively impact the candidate

Conduct an environmental scan. Does the environment support diversity?
Hiring decisions

Candidates with the most years experience are not necessarily the most qualified

Encourage the committee to be inclusive instead of exclusive when composing the final list of applicants

Provide report of the entire selection process with a focus on how underrepresented groups were included. This should be reviewed and approved by diversity expert.

Publically available report of selection committee composition.
Hiring Process Guides that We Selected from Online Resources

- http://diversity.berkeley.edu/sites/default/files/recruiting_a_more_diverse_workforce_uhs.pdf
References


Committee (Non-search) membership

Recommend composition of committees strive for a minimum of 40% of each male and female leadership.

Annually senior leadership in conjunction with diversity expert should review committee composition and should track results.

Committees lacking the minimum 40% of either gender will be tracked and noted and one of the following will be pursued:

- Add additional members from the underrepresented gender
- Appoint a deputy chairperson from the underrepresented group
- Seek members from underrepresented group elsewhere within the University
- Recommend changes to composition (limit terms, limit ex-officio members, broaden eligibility from more junior members)
- Schedule and organize meetings that work for as many staff as possible with consideration to staff who have caring responsibilities

Annual reviews

- Committees with less than 40% of either gender should report how they plan to mitigate that or what has been done previously to increase representation from underrepresented gender
References


Speaker and Conference Recruitment Planning

Create a registry of potential female speakers, keynote, and session chairs

Ensure that all aspects of the conference take into account gender equity

• Who is on the planning committee?
• Who are the chairs?
• What is the make up of proposed speakers?
  ▪ Recommend looking at total speakers as well as keynote speakers
• Pay attention to marketing materials (pamphlets, websites, etc.) ensuring that conference materials take a diverse and equitable approach to representing men and women and ensuring roles equally spread out (i.e. men and women pictured as physicians)
• Track results and publically report them
• If disparities exist, explore why and prepare a plan to improve gender diversity
References


Casadevall A. Achieving Speaker Gender Equity at the American Society for Microbiology General Meeting. MBio 2015;6:e01146.

http://www.sciencemag.org/careers/2015/07/countering-gender-bias-conferences
Reporting

Monitor and report on gender equity results

- [Provide link here for tools]
- [Provide link here for tools]
- [Provide link here for tools]

House high level reporting documents in a transparent and accessible format (i.e. website)
We want your feedback!

We aim for this toolkit to be a “living” document improved by real-time constructive feedback.

**Please send feedback on this toolkit and our checklists and reporting tools to: ___________________
Authors and contact information

- Marisha Burden, MD - Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu
- Amira del Pino-Jones, MD – Amira.delPino-Jones@ucdenver.edu
- Michelle Shafer, MD – mshafer@bwh.Harvard.edu
- Sangini Sheth, MD – Sangini.sheth@yale.edu
- Kathryn Rexrode, MD – Krexrode@bwh.Harvard.edu
## Basic Steps to Achieving Gender Equity in Recruitment to Committees

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Composition of Committee Members</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Formalize a process for invitation for committee members with high consideration for open invitation to key stakeholders. If no, document rationale for appointing members.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• There is gender balance among the committee members. [Should there not be sufficient diversity from within a group then seek diversity from members external to the group] Goal: Minimum of 40% for either gender.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• All committee members have (or will have received) unconscious bias training. See toolkit for resources.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Annual Committee Review

- Senior leadership in conjunction with equity/diversity expert have reviewed committee composition (Date: _____)

### Reporting

- Committee composition will be publically reported as well as how membership is selected (appointed, elected, etc.)
- Committees lacking the minimum 40% of either gender will prepare report on how they will increase the representation of the underrepresented group to senior level/executive level leadership

### Reporting for Committees lacking the minimum 40% of either gender will:

- Add additional members from the underrepresented gender
- Appoint a deputy chairperson from the underrepresented gender
- Seek members from the underrepresented group elsewhere within the organization
- Recommend changes to composition (limit terms, limit ex-officio members, broaden eligibility for more junior members) declined, final candidates, etc.
- Schedule and organize meetings that work for as many staff as possible with consideration for staff who have caring responsibilities

## References:


Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu
### Basic Steps to Achieving Speaker Gender Balance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conference planning</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • There is gender balance among the meeting or conference planners/committee.  
[Consider having a diversity expert serve on the planning committee] |     |    |
| • Committee has reviewed the speaker data (with breakdown by gender) from the previous meeting or conference?  
[This should include number of men and women for: keynote speakers, speakers, leadership of interest groups or other similar events, attendee makeup of the conference, membership in the professional society, department, etc.]  
Please see conference data tracking sheet. |     |    |
| • Committee/organization/group has developed a speaker policy that addresses goals for gender equity.  
For example, “The conference committee wants to achieve a gender balance of speakers that roughly reflects that of its audience.” |     |    |
| • Speaker policy is visible and publically available and reported to the public including websites, advertisements, and/or invitations that are sent to speakers/attendees. |     |    |
| • Planning committee has developed a database of qualified, diverse speakers, both regionally and nationally. |     |    |
| • Planning committee has worked with public relations/advertising to ensure that marketing materials have diverse and equitable representation of men and women, paying attention to roles they play in the advertisements [i.e. if pictures of providers utilized ensuring that men and women are pictured in these roles] |     |    |

### Annual Reporting

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| • Planning committee completed annual report.  
Please see conference data tracking sheet.  
[Examine those invited, those who declined, final speakers examining by role (if applicable)] |     |    |
| • Reviewed annual reporting with action plan as needed for gender equity.  
See example of action plan for increased gender equity/diversity. |     |    |
| • Reporting presented to organization leadership (i.e. executive committee, high level leadership) |     |    |

### References:
Casadevall A. Achieving Speaker Gender Equity at the American Society for Microbiology General Meeting. MBio 2015;6:e01146.
Questions or feedback:  Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu
### Basic Steps to Achieving Gender Equity in Recruitment – Recruitment

#### Search Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>There is gender balance among the committee members. [Should there not be sufficient diversity from within a group then seek diversity from members external to the group]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Equity/diversity expert will serve on the planning committee or at serve as an advisor to the committee.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>All committee members have (or will have received) unconscious bias training. See toolkit for resources.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Selection committee has access to a recruitment toolkit with methodology on how to create job description, evaluating applications with nontraditional components, list of interview questions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Committee has or will review diversity of applicants at each stage and will plan accordingly when there is a lack of gender equity/representation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Criteria for selection have been determined in advance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Job description/job posting/advertisement

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Diversity expert has reviewed job posting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Inclusive unbiased, ungendered language has been utilized throughout the job description. Have avoided prioritizing traits that are traditionally masculine.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Applicants required to submit a track record related to diversity (i.e. commitment to equity statement) and is stated in the job posting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Advertise widely including professional societies and associations of designated groups.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Interview

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Selection criteria ranked in advance to ensure unbiased, consistent, and transparent selection process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Variety of formats are planned for interview (small groups, one on one, town hall).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Candidates explicitly told that career breaks for family/medical leave will not negatively impact candidate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Hiring Decisions/Reporting

<p>| | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Report provided of the entire selection process with a focus on how women and other underrepresented groups were identified. Should be reviewed and approved by diversity expert. [Examine candidates invited, those who declined, final candidates, etc.]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Report of selection committee composition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### References:

- Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.DelPino-jones@ucdenver.edu
### Conference tracking sheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year:_______</th>
<th>Total N</th>
<th>Male (N, %)</th>
<th>Female (N, %)</th>
<th>URM* (N, %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Membership of organization, department, division, or other group [If there is not gender equity, examine the reason why]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Planning committee composition</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Total speakers (for annual conference, or if reoccurring throughout the year include total for the year) INVITED; [track declined invitations and find out why]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Total speakers (for annual conference, or if reoccurring throughout the year include total for the year) ACCEPTED</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Keynote/featured speakers (typically if at a conference they are the only speakers at that time, somehow highlighted as different from other speakers)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Focus group/interest group leads (or similar type of group lead)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Reporting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conference statistics are publically reported (i.e. placed onto website, conference marketing materials, annual report for organization)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conference statistics compared to previous years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity (if applicable)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report and action plan shared with executive level leadership/high level leadership</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

URM = Under-represented minority;  
*Tracking for underrepresented minorities should be done separate from tracking for gender equity (i.e. goal should be to achieve equity in representation from women and URMs, not one or the other)*

Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.Delpino-Jones@ucdenver.edu
### Recruitment requiring search committee - tracking sheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Selection Committee</th>
<th>Total N</th>
<th>Male (N, %)</th>
<th>Female (N, %)</th>
<th>URM* (N, %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Composition of search committee</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Composition of all applicants – [if lack of diversity, action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Composition of applicants invited for in person interview [add additional rows as needed for each step in selection process] [if lack of diversity, action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity]</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reporting</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment statistics above are publically reported (i.e. placed onto website, reports to senior level leadership)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report provided of the entire selection process with a focus on how women and other underrepresented groups were identified.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity/equity assessed at each key step of process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity (if applicable)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Report and action plan shared with executive level leadership</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

URM = Under-represented minority; *Tracking for underrepresented minorities should be done separate from tracking for gender equity (i.e. goal should be to achieve equity in representation from women and URMs, not one or the other)

Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.Delpino-jones@ucdenver.edu
# Committee Membership - Tracking Sheet

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Committee Characteristics</th>
<th>Total N</th>
<th>Male (N, %)</th>
<th>Female (N, %)</th>
<th>URM* (N, %)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Composition of committee</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reporting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Recruitment statistics above are publically reported (i.e. placed onto website, reports to senior level leadership)

Action plan developed for increased gender equity/diversity (if applicable)

Report and action plan shared with executive level leadership (if applicable)

Committee members have received unconscious bias training

URM = Under-represented minority;
*Tracking for underrepresented minorities should be done separate from tracking for gender equity (i.e. goal should be to achieve equity in representation from women and URMs, not one or the other)

Questions or feedback: Please email Marisha.Burden@ucdenver.edu and Amira.Delpino-jones@ucdenver.edu